VI. Summary

The dynamic nature of the telecommunications industry makes it unlikely that a rigid limit on spectrum allocations can be optimal at all times in all regions. The market is the best mechanism for achieving efficient aggregations of spectrum to permit successful competitors to expand. Successful firms should have the option to purchase spectrum from unsuccessful rivals. The Commission and the federal antitrust agencies can protect consumer welfare by evaluating the competitive impact of proposed industry consolidations on a case-by-case basis.

At the present time, cellular and broadband PCS providers compete directly with ESMR services. Thus, any cap applied to broadband should also apply to ESMR. However, given current market conditions, paging, narrowband PCS, and mobile satellite services do not compete with broadband services and so should not be part of the same cap.

Finally, the Commission's proposed five percent ownership attribution threshold appears too low. Given the costs and benefits of ownership attribution limits, a relatively high threshold is desirable. Such a threshold avoids the inefficiencies that will be caused by a low standard, such as the Commission's proposed five percent threshold, while not causing significant adverse competitive effects because of the ability of the Commission and the federal antitrust agencies to prohibit proposed acquisitions that would harm consumers.

Friday November 12, 1993

CURRICULUM VITAE

R. PRESTON McAFEE

PERSONAL

Date and Place of Birth:

July 7, 1956, Greenwich, CT USA

Address:

Department of Economics

University of Texas at Austin

Austin TX 78712

Telephones:

Office Phone: (512) 471-3211

Office Fax:

(512) 471-3510

Home Phone: (512) 328-1635

Home Fax:

(512) 328-1787

Email:

mcafee@mundo.eco.utexas.edu

EDUCATION

Ph.D. (Economics)

Purdue University, 1980

(Economics) M.S.

Purdue University, 1978

M.S.

(Mathematics) Purdue University, 1978

B.A. (Economics) University of Florida, 1976 (Highest Honors, Phi Beta Kappa)

ACADEMIC EXPERIENCE

Rex G. Baker, Jr., Professor of Political Economy, University of Texas at Austin, 1990-Professor of Economics, University of Western Ontario, 1989-1990 Visiting Professor of Economics, California Institute of Technology, 1989-90 Visiting Associate Professor of Economics, California Institute of Technology, 1988-9 Associate Professor of Economics, University of Western Ontario, 1987-9 Assistant Professor of Economics, University of Western Ontario, 1981-7 Visiting Assistant Professor of Economics, Purdue University, 1980-1

CONSULTING EXPERIENCE

Analysis Group, 1988-present

U.S. Department of Justice, Antitrust Division, 1987 Department of Supply and Services, Canada, 1986 Ontario Economic Council, 1985-6.

PROFESSIONAL ACTIVITIES

Co-Editor, American Economic Review, 1993-

Associate Editor, American Economic Review, 1992-3

Associate Editor, Journal of Economic Theory, 1993-

Member of AEA, Econometric Society, Society for the Promotion of Economic Theory, and Associate of American Bar Association.

Referee for AER, Econometrica, JET, JPE, REStud, JEL, QJE, J Math E, J Monetary E, EJ, IER, CJE, J. F., JOLE, JEBO, Rand, J Pub E, IJIO, J Econometrics, Economica, REStat, J E Ed., J Law E&O, European E Review, Scandanavian J E, SEPS, Math Soc. Sciences, ORSA J of Computing, J E Bus, Energy J, J Real Estate F&E, Contemporary Acc. Res., NSF

PUBLICATIONS

ARTICLES

- [1] "Opportunism in Multilateral Vertical Contracting: Nondiscrimination, Exclusivity and Uniformity", American Economic Review, forthcoming (with Marius Schwartz).
- [2] "Mechanism Design by Competing Sellers", Econometrica, forthcoming.
- [3] "Endogenous Availability, Cartels and Merger in an Equilibrium Price Dispersion", forthcoming Journal of Economic Theory.
- [4] "Industrial Blackmail: Dynamic Tax Competition and Public Investment", forthcoming Canadian Journal of Economics (with Ian King and Linda Welling).
- [5] "The Price Decline Anomaly", Journal of Economic Theory 60, June, 1993, 191-212 (with Daniel Vincent).
- [6] "Horizontal Mergers in Spatially Differentiated Noncooperative Markets" Journal of Industrial Economics XL, December 1992, 349-57 (with Joseph Simons and Michael Williams).
- [7] "Updating the Reserve Price in Common Value Auctions" American Economic Review Papers and Proceedings, May 1992, 512-8 (with Daniel Vincent).
- [8] "The Competitive Effects Section", International Merger Law Events and Commentary 21, May 1992, 6-9 (with Joseph Simons and Michael Williams).
- [9] "Investment Decisions under First and Second Price Auctions", *Economic Letters*, 1992, 289-93 (with Ian King and Linda Welling).
- [10] "Animal Spirits" American Economic Review 82, no.3, June 1992, 493-507 (with Peter Howitt).
- [11] "Bidding Rings", American Economic Review 82, no.3, June 1992, 579-99 (with John McMillan).
- [12] "Amicable Divorce: Dissolving a Partnership with Simple Mechanisms", Journal of Economic Theory 56, no.2, April 1992, 266-93.
- [13] "A Dominant Strategy Double Auction", Journal of Economic Theory 56, no.2, April 1992, 434-50.
- [14] "Horizontal Mergers and Antitrust Policy", Journal of Industrial Economics XL, June 1992, 181-7 (with Michael Williams).
- [15] "A Stone-Weierstrass Theorem without Closure under Suprema", Proceedings of the American Mathematical Society 114, Number 1, January 1992, 61-67 (with Philip Reny).

- [16] "On What Economic Grounds should Horizontal Mergers be Challenged?", International Merger Law (with Michael Williams), no. 7, March 1991.
- [17] "Optimal Contracts for Teams", International Economic Review 32, no.3, August 1991: 561-77 (with John McMillan).
- [18] "Correlated Information and Mechanism Design", Econometrica 60, No. 2, March 1992, 395-421 (with Philip Reny).
- [19] "Efficient Allocation with Continuous Quantities", Journal of Economic Theory 53, no. 1, February 1991: 51-74.
- [20] "Externalities and Asymmetric Information", Quarterly Journal of Economics CVI, no. 1, February 1991: 103-121 (with Jeremy Greenwood).
- [21] "Extracting the Surplus in Common Value Auctions", *Econometrica* 57, no 6, November, 1989: 1451-9, (with John McMillan and Philip Reny).
- [22] "The Department of Justice Merger Guidelines: A Critique and a Proposed Improvement", Pepperdine Law Review 6, no.4, 1989 (with Michael Williams).
- [23] "Government Procurement and International Trade", Journal of International Economics 26, 1989: 291-308 (with John McMillan).
- [24] "Commodity Bundling by a Monopolist," Quarterly Journal of Economics, May 1989, 371-83 (with John McMillan and Michael Whinston).
- [25] "Multidimensional Incentive Compatibility and Mechanism Design", Journal of Economic Theory 46, December 1988: 335-54 (with John McMillan).
- [26] "Stability of Equilibria with Aggregate Externalities", Quarterly Journal of Economics 103, May 1988: 261-77 (with Peter Howitt).
- [27] "Search Mechanisms", Journal of Economic Theory 44, February 1988: 99-123 (with John McMillan).
- [28] "Can Event Studies Detect Anticompetitive Mergers?", Economic Letters 28, 1988: 199-203 (with Michael Williams).
- [29] "Auctions with a Stochastic Number of Bidders", Journal of Economic Theory 43, October 1987: 1-19 (with John McMillan).
- [30] "Competition For Agency Contracts", Rand Journal of Economics, Summer 1987 (with John McMillan).
- [31] "Auctions with Entry", Economics Letters 23, 1987: 343-7 (with John McMillan).

- [32] "Auctions and Bidding", Journal of Economic Literature, June 1987 (with John McMillan).
- [33] "Nonlinear Contracts, Zero Profits and Moral Hazard", Economica 54, February 1987: 97-102 (with Raymond Fishe).
- [34] "Costly Search and Recruiting", International Economic Review 28, February 1987: 89-107 (with Peter Howitt).
- [35] "Bidding for Contracts: A Principal-Agent Analysis", Rand Journal of Economics, Autumn 1986 (with John McMillan)
- [36] "Sequential Procurement Auctions", Journal of Public Economics 31, 1986: 181-95 (with Richard Luton).
- [37] "Optimal Tenure and the Timing of Faculty Meetings", Studies in Economic Analysis 10, 1986.
- [38] "Unemployment Insurance and the Entitlement Effect: A Tax Incidence Approach", International Economic Review 27, February 1986 (with John Barron and Paul Speaker).
- [39] "Joint Search for Several Goods", Journal of Economic Theory 32, April 1984 (with John Carlson).
- [40] "American Economic Growth and the Voyage of Columbus", American Economic Review, September 1983.
- [41] "Discrete Equilibrium Price Dispersion", Journal of Political Economy, June 1983 (with John Carlson).
- [42] "On the use of Bonus Payments in an Experimental Study of Electricity Demand", Review of Economics and Statistics LXV, no.3, August 1983: 506-11 (with Raymond Fishe).
- [43] "Optimal Design of a Decision Support System", International Journal of Policy Analysis and Information Systems 6, 1982 (with Andrew Whinston).
- [44] "An OIS Model for Internal Control Evaluation", ACM Transactions on Office Information Systems, ACM-SIGOA, November 1982 (with Andrew Bailey, James Gerlach and Andrew Whinston).
- [45] "An Application of Complexity Theory to the Analysis of Internal Control", Auditing: A Journal of Practice and Theory, Summer 1981: 38-52 (with Andrew Bailey and Andrew Whinston).
- [46] "Internal Accounting Controls in the Office of the Future", *IEEE Computer Journal*, May 1981 (with Andrew Bailey, James Gerlach and Andrew Whinston).
- [47] "Formal Analysis of Internal Control-An Introduction" The Proceedings of the First European Workshop on Information Systems, Aix-en-Provence, 1981 (with Andrew Bailey, James Gerlach and Andrew Whinston).

[48] "A Formal Model of Problem Solving", International Journal of Policy Analysis and Information Systems 4, 1980 (with Andrew Whinston).

BOOK

Incentives in Government Contracting, with John McMillan, Toronto: University of Toronto Press, December, 1988.

CHAPTERS IN BOOKS

- [1] "Modelling Transactions under Asymmetric Information", Recent Developments in Game Theory, Eds: J. Creedie, J. Eichberger, and J. Borland, London: Edward Elger, 1991 (with John McMillan).
- [2] "Ticom II The Internal Control Language An Introduction", Internal Control and the Impact of the Foreign Corrupt Practices Act, ed: Abdel-Khalik, Gainesville: University of Florida Press, 1982 (with Andrew Bailey, James Gerlach and Andrew Whinston).
- [3] "Office Automation", Handbook of Industrial Engineering, New York: Wiley and Sons, 1982 (with Andrew Bailey, James Gerlach and Andrew Whinston).

BOOK REVIEW

The Economics of Conformism, by Stephen Jones, reviewed for The Canadian Journal of Economics, February 1986, reprinted in The Canadian Journal of Economics, February, 1987.

UNPUBLISHED MANUSCRIPTS (most recent version in parentheses)

- "Damaged Goods" (1993) (with Ray Deneckere)
- "Collusive Bidding in Hostile Takeovers", (1993) (with Dan Vincent, Mike Williams and Melanie Havens)
- "Multiproduct Equilibrium Price Dispersion" (1991)
- "Organizational Diseconomies of Scale" (1992) (with John McMillan)

MICHAEL A. WILLIAMS

	Williams, a Vice President of Analysis Group, specializes in analyses involving industrial ation, antitrust, and regulation. His research includes:
۵	Studies of horizontal and vertical mergers to determine whether they would lead to the exercise of market power in such industries as airlines, avionics, bus and truck transportation, electric utilities, natural gas pipelines, radio and television programming, satellites, and other industries.
ū	Analyses of antitrust issues, including monopolization, price fixing, resale price maintenance, and tying arrangements, in a variety of industries.
۵	Evaluation of rate and entry regulation in the natural gas, electric power, postal service, securities, and telecommunications industries.
۵	Market definition analyses for both antitrust and economic markets.
0	Market studies to evaluate how prices in long-term contracts should be determined in the context of arbitration proceedings.
ū	Analyses of liability and damages in issues involving breach of contract and copyright infringement.
ū	Market studies to determine the prudency of long-term contracts.
Mr. Williams received his M.A. and Ph.D. in Economics from the University of Chicago. He holds a B.A. in Economics from the University of California, Santa Barbara. He was formerly an economist with the U.S. Department of Justice, Antitrust Division.	

SELECTED CASE WORK

FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION

Implementation of Section 309(j) of the Communications Act Competitive Bidding, RP Docket 93-253

Economic analyses of auction design for the sale of spectrum license rights for Personal Communications Services, 1993-1994.

CONTRACT ARBITRATION PANEL

Tocso Refining Company and GWF

Testimony on market definition in price redetermination for sale of petroleum coke, 1993.

FEDERAL ENERGY REGULATORY COMMISSION

In the Matter of Stingray Pipeline Company, Docket No. RP91-212-000

Economic analysis of market power issues in pipeline transportation services, 1992-1993.

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA FOR THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

Stuart Breslow, etc. et al. v. Precision Electronic Engineering, Inc., etc., et al.

Deposition testimony and economic analysis of antitrust claim, 1992-1993.

FEDERAL ENERGY REGULATORY COMMISSION

Great Lakes Gas Transmission Limited Partnership, Docket No. RP91-143

Economic analyses of incremental versus rolled-in ratemaking treatment for pipeline expansion, 1991-1993.

CONTRACT ARBITRATION PANEL

Texas Eastern Gas Pipeline Company and ProGas Limited
Economic analysis of competitive price of natural gas, 1992.

INTERNATIONAL CHAMBER OF COMMERCE

Panhandle Eastern Pipe Line Company v. Northwest Alaskan Pipeline Company Economic analysis of competitive price of natural gas, 1992.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

Litton Co. v. Honeywell, Inc.

Economic analysis of the antitrust claim, 1992.

NEW JERSEY DISTRICT COURT

Sands Casino, Inc. v. Trump Properties

Economic analysis of the antitrust claim, 1991-1992.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT, RHODE ISLAND

Metals Recycling, Inc. v. American Waste Services, Inc., American Landfill, Inc. and Envirco Transportation Management, Inc.

Economic analysis of antitrust tying claim, 1992.



FEDERAL ENERGY REGULATORY COMMISSION

Equitrans, Inc. v. Texas Eastern Transmission Corporation, Docket Nos. RP90-15-000, et al.

Economic analyses of market power and comparability of unbundled transportation service with the transportation service embedded in system sales service, 1990-1992.

CONTRACT ARBITRATION PANEL

Texas Eastern Transmission Corporation and W&T Offshore, Inc.
Economic analysis of competitive price of natural gas, 1991.

FEDERAL ENERGY REGULATORY COMMISSION

In Re Pipeline Service Obligations, Docket Nos. RM91-11-000, et al.

Economic analysis of the comparability of unbundled transportation service on interstate natural gas pipelines with the transportation service embedded in system sales service, 1991.

STATE OF ALASKA

In the Matter of: Marathon Oil

Economic analysis of the valuation of natural gas, 1990.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT, DALLAS COUNTY, TEXAS

Fulbright & Jaworksi v. The Kiwi Aviation Group, Inc., et al.

Economic analysis of predation claim in the business jet industry, 1990.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT, DISTRICT OF CONNECTICUT

Great Northern Nekoosa Corporation v. Georgia-Pacific Corporation et al. Economic analysis of the proposed acquisition, 1989-1990.

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

In the Matter of: Elf Aquitaine, Inc. and Pennwalt, Inc. Economic analysis of the proposed merger, 1989.

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

In the Matter of: American Airlines and Delta Airlines

Economic analysis of the proposed merger of computer reservation systems, 1989.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

USAir, Inc. et al. v. American Airlines, Inc. and United Airlines, Inc. Economic analysis of the antitrust claim, 1989.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

San Diego Wood Preserving, Inc. v. Reichhold Chemicals, Inc.

Deposition testimony and economic analysis of damage claim, 1989.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

City of Vernon v. Southern California Edison Company
Economic analysis of antitrust claim, 1989.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

Oasis Petroleum Corporation v. Texaco Oil Corporation Economic analysis of breach of contract, 1989.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

Moldex Metric Corporation v. Minnesota Mining and Manufacturing Corporation Economic analysis of antitrust claim, 1988.

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, LOS ANGELES COUNTY Staley et al. v. Tibbals et al.

Economic analysis of legal malpractice claim, 1988.

PUBLICATIONS

- "The Renaissance of Market Definition," *The Antitrust Bulletin*, (1993) vol. 38, no. 4, pp. 799-857, (with Joseph J. Simons).
- "Horizontal Mergers in Spatially Differentiated Noncooperative Markets," *Journal of Industrial Economics*, (1992) vol. 40, no. 4, pp. 349-358, (with R. Preston McAfee and Joseph J. Simons).
- "Recent Developments in Economic Theory Regarding the Competitive Effects of Horizontal Mergers," International Merger Law, (1992) (with R. Preston McAfee).
- "Horizontal Mergers and Antitrust Policy," Journal of Industrial Economics, (1992) vol. 40, no. 2, pp. 181-188 (with R. Preston McAfee).
- "New U.S. Merger Enforcement Guidelines: Competitive Effects," *International Merger Law*, (1992) no. 21, pp. 6-9 (with R. Preston McAfee and Joseph J. Simons).
- "On What Economic Grounds Should Horizontal Mergers Be Challenged?" International Merger Law, (1991) no. 7, pp. 16-18 (with R. Preston McAfee).
- "Consumer Welfare Loss: The Unawarded Damages in Antitrust Suits," *University of Dayton Law Review*, (1990) vol. 15, no. 3, pp. 457-470 (with Melanie Williams Havens and Michael F. Kochn).
- "Concentration, Potential Entry, and Performance in the Airline Industry," *Journal of Industrial Economics*, (1989) vol. 37, no. 2, pp. 119-139 (with Gloria J. Hurdle, Richard L. Johnson, Andrew S. Joskow, and Gregory J. Werden).
- "The Department of Justice Merger Guidelines: A Critique and a Proposed Improvement," Pepperdine Law Review, (1989) vol. 16, no. 4, pp. 1069-1081 (with R. Preston McAfee).



- "Can the Concentration-Collusion Hypothesis Be Refuted Empirically?" *Economics Letters*, (1989) vol. 30, no. 3, pp. 253-257 (with Gregory J. Werden).
- "The Role of Stock Market Studies in Formulating Antitrust Policy Toward Horizontal Mergers," Quarterly Journal of Business and Economics, (1989) vol. 28, no. 4, pp. 3-21 (with Gregory J. Werden).
- "The Role of Stock Market Studies in Formulating Antitrust Policy Toward Horizontal Mergers: Reply," Quarterly Journal of Business and Economics, (1989) vol. 28, no. 4, pp. 39-42 (with Gregory J. Werden).
- "Can Event Studies Detect Anticompetitive Mergers?" Economics Letters, (1988) vol. 28, no. 2, pp. 199-203 (with R. Preston McAfee).
- "An Empirical Test of Cooperative Game Solution Concepts," *Behavioral Science*, (1988) vol. 33, no. 3, pp. 224-237.
- "Output-Inflation Tradeoffs in 34 Countries: Comment," Journal of Economics and Business, (1988) vol. 40, no. 1, pp. 97-101 (with Michael G. Baumann).
- "Explaining and Predicting Airline Yields With Nonparametric Regression Trees," *Economics Letters*, (1987) vol. 24, no. 1, pp. 99-105 (with Andrew S. Joskow, Richard L. Johnson, and Gloria J. Hurdle).
- "Rankings of Economics Departments By Field," American Economist, (1987) vol. 31, no. 1, pp. 56-61 (with Michael G. Baumann and Gregory J. Werden).
- "International Evidence on Output-Inflation Tradeoffs: A Bootstrap Analysis," *Economics Letters*, (1986) vol. 21, no. 2, pp. 149-153 (with Michael G. Baumann).
- "An Economic Application of Bootstrap Statistical Methods: Addyston Pipe Revisited," American Economist (1986) vol. 30, no. 2, pp. 52-58.
- "Bootstrap Statistical Analysis of Time-Series Regressions," SAS Communications, (1986) vol. 11, no.3 (with Michael G. Baumann).
- "On the Demise of the Telephone Network and Why It Happened," Public Utilities Fortnightly, (1986) vol. 118, no. 5, p. 6.

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE REPORTS (CONTRIBUTOR)

- Reply Comments of the U.S. Department of Justice Before the Federal Communications Commission, "Policy and Rules Concerning Rates for Dominant Carriers," Docket No. 87-313, December 11, 1987.
- Comments of the U.S. Department of Justice Before the Federal Communications Commission, "The Bell Atlantic Telephone Companies' Offer of Comparably Efficient Interconnection to Enhanced Service Providers," Docket No. 85-229, June 15, 1987.

- Comments of the U.S. Department of Justice Before the Federal Communications Commission, "Decreased Regulation of Certain Basic Telecommunications Services," Docket No. 86-421, March 6, 1987.
- Comments of the U.S. Department of Justice Before the Securities and Exchange Commission, "Self-Regulatory Organizations: Proposed Rule Change by New York Stock Exchange, Inc. Relating to Amendments to the Exchange's Voting Rights Listing Standards for Domestic Companies," File No. SR-NYSE-86-17, December 5, 1986.
- Comments of the U.S. Department of Justice Before the Securities and Exchange Commission, "Concept Release on Takeovers and Contests for Corporate Control," File No. 57-18-86, October 17, 1986.
- Comments of the U.S. Department of Justice Before the Federal Communications Commission, "Amendment of Section 64.702 of the Commission's Rules and Regulations (Third Computer Inquiry)," Docket No. 85-229 Phase II, August 8, 1986.
- Comments of the U.S. Department of Justice Before the Federal Communications Commission, "Separation of Costs of Nonregulated Activities," Docket No. 86-111, July 30, 1986.
- Comments of the U.S. Department of Justice Before the United States Postal Service, "Restrictions on Private Carriage of Letters; Proposed Suspension of the Private Express Statutes; International Remailing," July 17, 1986.
- Comments of the U.S. Department of Justice Before the Federal Communications Commission, "Separation of Costs of Regulated Telephone Service From Costs of Nonregulated Activities," Docket No. 86-111, June 30, 1986.
- Comments of the U.S. Department of Justice Before the United States Postal Service, "International Priority Airmail Service," June 9, 1986.
- Comments of the U.S. Department of Justice Before the United States Postal Service, "Restrictions on Private Carriage of Letters; Proposed Clarification and Modification of Definition and of Regulations on Extremely Urgent Letters," December 12, 1985.
- Notice of Intervention of the U.S. Department of Justice as a Limited Participator and Opposition to USPS Motion for Waiver, Destination BMC Parcel Post Classification and Rate Changes (Experiment)," November 22, 1985.
- Comments of the U.S. Department of Justice Before the Federal Communications Commission, "Investigation of Access and Divestiture Related Tariffs," Docket No. 83-1145, April 8, 1985.

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE CASES

Merger Investigations

General Electric Company's acquisition of RCA.

Westwood One, Inc.'s acquisition of NBC Radio.



Turner Broadcasting System, Inc.'s attempted acquisition of CBS.

Norfolk Southern, Inc.'s acquisition of North American Van Lines.

Cooper Industries, Inc.'s acquisition of Westinghouse Electric, Corp.'s Lighting Fixture Business.

Boise Cascade, Corp.'s acquisition of the Missisquoi Division of Saxon Industries.

Southwestern Public Service Company's acquisition of New Mexico Electric Service Company.

ITT-Continental Baking Company's acquisition of Bost Bakery, Inc.

Williams Companies' acquisition of Northwest Energy, Corp.

Archer-Daniel-Midland's acquisition of Gold Kist's Valdosta, Georgia Soybean Processing plant.

Price Fixing

United States of America v. Weeks Marine, Inc.

Consent Decrees

United States of America v. Wallpaper Institute

United States of America v. Greyhound, Corp.

United States of America v. Cooper Industries, Inc.

United States of America v. Balley Manufacturing, Corp.